

**CITY OF GLENDALE
COMMISSION ON PERSONS WITH DISABILITIES
PUBLIC MEETING
GLENDALE MAIN LIBRARY - BOARD ROOM, 2ND FLOOR
5959 WEST BROWN STREET
MEETING MINUTES**

**TUESDAY, AUGUST 16, 2011
6:00PM**

MEMBERS PRESENT: Mounib Shaaban, Chairperson
Shirley Galvez, Vice Chair
Gary Charlson
Laura Hirsch
Karin Kellas
John Fallucca
Terry Aramian
Raymond Yaeggi
Joan Brainard Pinson
Adonis Deniz, Sr.

MEMBERS ABSENT: Robert Steiger

STAFF PRESENT: Jim Colson, Deputy City Manager
Gilbert Lopez, Revitalization Administrator
Minerva Madrid, Revitalization Secretary
Diana Figueroa, Recording Secretary

- I. Call To Order and Introductions
Chairperson Shaaban called the meeting to order at approximately 6:00 p.m. He introduced Mr. Jim Colson, Deputy City Manager.
- II. Roll Call
Chairperson Shaaban took roll call and noted members who were present and those absent.
- III. Approval of Meeting Minutes - April 19, 2011, and May 17, 2011
Chairperson Shaaban called for a motion on the minutes. He stated he would like the 2010 Annual Report in its entirety included in the May 17, 2011 minutes.

Commissioner Aramian made a motion to approve the minutes from the April 19, 2011 meeting as well as the minutes with the noted revision of May 17, 2011. Commissioner Yaeggi seconded the motion, which was approved unanimously.
- IV. Business from the Floor

Chairperson Shaaban called for business from the floor. There was none.

V. Raising Awareness

Chairperson Shaaban stated the website is a great tool in order to raise awareness and get information regarding the Commission to the public. He asked the Commission to brainstorm and bring any new ideas to the Commission meeting for discussion. He stated the Eyes of Glendale is an excellent tool.

VI. Glendale Bus Stop Improvements

Chairperson Shaaban asked for an update. Mr. Lopez stated the Valley Metro operates the bus system which the City of Glendale is a part of. Mr. Lopez explained the location of the bus shelters are based upon distance. He said there is a distance requirement when determining where the shelters will be located. In addition, he suggested the Commission to invite a representative from the Glendale Dial-A-Ride Division to provide more information or answer any questions the Commission may have.

Commissioner Aramian asked who is financially responsible for the bus shelters. Mr. Lopez stated the shelters are located in the city's right-of-way, therefore, he believes the city is required to maintain the shelters.

VII. Intersection of 47th Avenue and Olive Avenue

Chairperson Shaaban asked for an update. Mr. Lopez stated more accurate pictures were distributed to the Commission of the improvement made to the northwest corner of this intersection.

VIII. Discuss on Format, Process and Deadlines for Commission Agendas and Minutes

Chairperson Shaaban explained with the recent change of liaisons, there appears to be confusion in process as it relates to the agenda and minutes. Planning the agenda is micromanaged and the complete minutes were published before the commissioners approved or made any changes to them. He stated he would like to place items for discussion on the agenda in the monthly commission meeting without having to explain or provide staff with backup information or clarification for his reasoning behind any additions.

Chairperson Shaaban provided background information as to how the agenda and the minutes are created and distributed. He said the agenda is composed of items are the Chairperson and Commission's request. The Commission determines the items for discussion and sets the agenda with assistance from the liaison. In addition, the Chairperson stated the meeting draft minutes should be distributed to the Chairperson and the Vice Chairperson for review shortly following the meeting. They ensure the accuracy and return the draft minutes to the liaison. At that point, the draft minutes are ready for distribution at the next meeting. He said once the minutes have been approved at the next meeting, they are published onto the webpage.

With the recent change of the liaison, the Chairperson stated changes have occurred. He said the minutes were not sent in a timely manner for review and the agenda is no longer under the control of the Commission. He said there were improvements recently and the

minutes were sent to him and the vice chairperson earlier, however, not within seven days.

Chairperson Shaaban stated the summary minutes are to be published within 48 hours, with the full minutes being posted to the website within two days of approval.

With regard to the agenda, he feels the Commission is being coached as to what should be included on the agenda in their public open meeting. He stated he preferred the format of the agenda used prior to the change of liaisons. He does not want to feel that he needs to clarify his reasoning for having an item listed on the agenda or for the commissioners to have to go through questioning before discussing any item.

The Chairperson requested that staff add requested items to the agenda as he and the Commissioners ask.

He asked for the Commission's comments.

Commissioner Yaeggi stated there are no opportunities on the agenda for New Business or Other Business items of discussion.

Commissioner Aramian stated Parliamentary Procedure and Robert's Rules are followed. He verified no minutes should be distributed until approved by the Commission.

Chairperson Shaaban stated although there was a set of draft minutes approved, that was an oversight. He said only the summary minutes would be published on the website within two days of the meeting.

Commissioner Fallucca verified the meeting was captured on audio tape.

Commissioner Deniz stated he was slated to speak at a previous meeting and was overlooked. He felt as though the Commission is being coached.

Commissioner Kellas stated she preferred the informal format of the agenda, although she believes the Commission only needs to adjust to the new format.

Chairperson Shaaban stated he is concerned about scheduling items on the agenda and having to explain himself.

Commissioner Pinson stated the Old Business is still listed on the agenda repeatedly.

Vice Chairperson Galvez asked if a vote could be taken regarding which style of agenda is preferred.

Chairperson Shaaban asked staff for their response.

Mr. Lopez indicated staff has verified with the City Clerk the procedure for posting the approved minutes as well as the summary minutes. He added this is not only city policy, but Arizona Revised Statutes regarding the open meeting laws. He clarified the summary

minutes is a snapshot of motions or actions were taken at the meeting. These minutes do not have any detail.

Mr. Lopez apologized if it appears staff was trying to influence the Commission, and stated that staffs' goal was to assist the commission within the structure used by all commissions and committees within the city. He stated he is following the guidelines and rules of the Open Meeting Laws. Mr. Lopez stated some agenda items did remain until the commission resolved or completed the item. He said staff supports the Commission but would like to see more structure, to make the commissions processes consistent with that of other City commissions and committees.

Chairperson stated this is an advisory commission and should be less structured than say the Planning Commission.

Mr. Lopez explained the Commission is appointed by Mayor and Council to represent Glendale citizens, which is a very important task. Because of this, items must be agendaized in order to allow the public the opportunity to voice their concerns, opinions, or to attend any meetings.

Commissioner Yaeggi stated the only impact this Commission has is to advise. He said there are no decisions made.

Commissioner Deniz asked if he had items for the agenda, would he need to get approval the month prior. He asked if items could not be discussed if they were not listed on the agenda. Mr. Lopez stated staff will do more research and continue to distribute information regarding upcoming events that may be of interest to the Commission. He said these types of items may need to be added to the agenda.

Commissioner Aramian stated something like this could be stated under New Business.

Mr. Lopez stated staff wants to ensure the proper staff and resources are available if needed to the Commission, which is why staff may ask for additional information or clarification on a proposed agenda item.

Chairperson Shaaban said this is not always the case as issues need to be discussed among the commissioners. He should not have to explain his reasoning for wishing to add an agenda item. Mr. Lopez stated he would verify with the City Clerk's Office regarding the proper procedure.

Mr. Colson stated citizen participation in the City is vital to the Mayor and Council. Input provided by Glendale's Boards and Commissions is highly valued. He believes the Commission's concerns are understandable, but he added staff does and must abide by State Law. He asked the Commission to allow staff to research and return before them with the information the Commission has requested.

Mr. Lopez stated he is not trying to coach the Commission; he only wishes to provide the Commission with information to support their concerns and questions.

Commissioner Aramian stated the agenda format previously used was that ordered by Robert's Rules. Chairperson Shaaban stated Mr. Lopez would be checking into the format as well.

The Commission and staff agreed to the following:

- The summary minutes will be posted to the city's website within 48 hours pursuant to Arizona Revised Statutes 38-431.
- Draft meeting minutes will be provided and emailed to the Chairperson and Vice Chairperson for review within seven days of the meeting.
- There will be more flexibility in composing the agenda, however, any items discussed must be included on the agenda in order to meeting the public meeting laws as well as provide the citizens and interested parties the opportunity to attend or express their concerns, opinions, or suggestions.
- Only approved meeting minutes will be posted to the city's website within 48 hours of approval.

IX. Changes to the CPWD Website and Communication with the Webmaster
Chairperson Shaaban said if there are any changes or additions to the Commission's website please contact Commissioner Hirsch, as she is the point of contact.

Commissioner Hirsch stated the "Did You Know Button" had been removed. Mr. Lopez indicated he had information added and the button was inadvertently removed. He stated he will contact the Webmaster to have it replaced.

Chairperson Shaaban added the webmasters have been very helpful and very responsive in designing and maintaining the Commission's website which is an important resource for the disabled community.

X. Community Revitalization Staff Updates and Comments
Chairperson Shaaban asked for staff's updates. Mr. Lopez provided an abbreviated PowerPoint presentation of his division. Chairperson Shaaban asked him to include information regarding the disabled in order to promote disabled awareness.

XI Commission Updates
Chairperson Shaaban called for Commission Updates.

Commissioner Deniz provided an update on the Health Fair Event that he attended on Saturday, April 12, 2011. He said approximately 25 people visited his table and asked about the Commission and their responsibilities. He suggested an information flyer be composed to distribute to interested parties at events such as the health fair.

Mr. Lopez stated he could contact Marketing and ask them to put together a draft pamphlet for the Commission's approval. The Commission felt this would be beneficial.

Commissioner Pinson stated there is an upcoming seminar regarding disabled persons and she felt informational pamphlets would be beneficial to distribute at similar functions.

Commissioner Yaeggi stated the American Legion and the Disabled American Veterans with the help of the City of Glendale's CAP Office will be giving money assistance to any members of the military and their struggling families.

Chairperson Shaaban reminded the Commission to send to him any items they would like to see included on next month's agenda.

With no further business, the Commission adjourned at 7:27pm.